



# Education Task Team

## Rural Community Specification and Selection Report

### Active Members of the Task Force:

**Debra Dupée, Steve Peters, Tom McCloud, Ron Schott, Mike Keeling, Deborah Whitten, Lillian Hritz, Cathy Poplin, Eric Thomas, Henry Goldberg, Galen Updike, Oris Friesen, Mike Whipple, Mike Golden, Brad Zerbe, Amy Chayefsky, Ted Kraver, Bill Casale, Jeffrey Crane, and Muralidharan Malavika**

**Presenter: Ted Kraver PhD** [ted@kraver.cc](mailto:ted@kraver.cc) **eSATS.org**

# 4 Meetings - 2.5 Week Process

- **Nominal Group Process**
  - Selection Criteria Issues
  - Rural Community Candidates
- **Zerbe, Friesen and Kraver Synthesized Lists**
- **Group discussions on Both Lists, 1-5 Ranking of Importance and Promise for ADCD Criteria**
- **Zerbe, Friesen and Kraver Developed Ranked Lists, Wrote Summary Report, Circulated**

# Selection Criteria

<b>Provisioning Broadband to Sites-Attributes</b>	<b>1</b>	<b>3</b>	<b>5</b>	<b>Score</b>	<b>Differentiation</b>
Adequate Broadband Capacity Delivered	0	0	9	45	10.4
Providers are Available to Develop Last Mile Access	0	1	8	43	8.4
Proximity to Broadband Off Ramps	1	3	6	40	5.4
Middle Mile Infrastructure with Competitive Rates	0	3	6	39	4.4
Cost Close to Rates in Developed Areas	1	2	6	37	2.4
Highway Affords Access to Middle-Mile Infrastructure	0	4	5	37	2.4
Ease of Obtaining Right-of-Way Permits	2	3	5	36	1.4
Rapid Permitting and Licensing	0	5	4	35	0.4
Broadband Provider Industry Must Support Program	1	3	5	35	0.4
Other Providers (like Govnet) and Grant Recipients are Available	2	4	4	34	-0.6
Ability to Factor in and Utilize Other Grant Recipients.	3	2	4	29	-5.6
Existence of Multiple Last Mile Providers	3	6	0	21	-13.6
Backhaul Capability in System for Reliability	1	1	3	19	-15.6
<b>Average</b>				<b>34.6</b>	
<b>State Support of Pilot Site Project</b>	<b>1</b>	<b>3</b>	<b>5</b>	<b>Score</b>	<b>Differentiation</b>
Identified Strong State Level Sponsor	1	0	8	41	6.7
Research on Effectiveness of Pilots and Associated Assessment	1	1	7	39	4.7
Access to Decision Support System for Digital Curriculum Adoption	2	1	6	35	0.7
In-service Educator Training, Development, Education	1	3	5	35	0.7
Pre-Service eLearning Teacher Education	1	4	4	33	-1.3
Access to ADE's SAIS and New AELAS	2	3	4	31	-3.3
Use in Multiple Applications Other than Education	1	5	2	26	-8.3
<b>Average</b>				<b>34.3</b>	

# Top Rated by Group



Towns	Groupings of Towns				Votes	Totals
Ak-Chin	Casa Grande					
Arizona City	Casa Grande				1	
Casa Grande	Casa Grande				2	
Casa Grande Area	Casa Grande				5	
Central AZ College - Coolidge	Casa Grande				2	
Eloy	Casa Grande				2	
Florence	Casa Grande				2	
Red Rock - twixt						
Tucson -Case Grande	Casa Grande					
Sacaton	Casa Grande					
Stanfield	Casa Grande					
Toltec	Casa Grande					14
Bisbee	Cochise County				1	
Ft. Huachuca	Cochise County				2	
Sierra Vista	Cochise County				3	
Tombstone	Cochise County				3	9
Sonoita	SE Wine Country				2	
Elgin	SE Wine Country				2	
Patagonia	SE Wine Country				2	
Wilcox	SE Wine Country				2	8
Jerome	Prescott				1	
Cottonwood	Prescott				1	
Clarkdale	Prescott				1	
Sedona	Prescott				1	
Peeples Valley	Prescott					
Prescott	Prescott				2	
Prescott Valley	Prescott				1	
Yarnell	Prescott					7

# Mid Rated by Group

Towns	Groupings of Towns				Votes	Totals
Alpine	Highway 191 Corridor (Northern)					
Eager	Highway 191 Corridor (Northern)				1	
Nutrioso	Highway 191 Corridor (Northern)					
Springerville	Highway 191 Corridor (Northern)				2	
Vernon	Highway 191 Corridor (Northern)					
St. Johns	Highway 191 Corridor (Northern)				2	
Clifton	Highway 191 Corridor (Southern)					
Duncan	Highway 191 Corridor (Southern)					5
Bullhead City	Colorado River				2	
Parker/CRIT	Colorado River				2	4
Paradise Valley	Urban				1	
Alhambra	Urban				1	
Creighton	Urban				1	3
Holbrook	I40				2	
Seligman	I40					2
Pinetop/Lakeside	Show Low Area				1	
Show Low	Show Low Area				1	2
Havasupai	Grand Canyon					
Hualapai	Grand Canyon				1	
Tusayan	Grand Canyon				1	2
Wickenburg	Wickenburg				2	2
Ajo	SW of Tucson				1	
Tohono O'Odham	SW of Tucson				1	2

# Bottom Rated by Group



Towns	Groupings of Towns			Votes	Totals
Gila Bend	Highway 85 - I8			1	1
Vail	SE of Tucson			1	1
Chinle	Navajo Nation			1	1
Tonopah	I10			1	1
Kingman	Highway 93				0
Aravaca	Nogales				
Nogales	Nogales				
Sasabe	Nogales				0
Somerton	Yuma				
Yuma	Yuma				0
Oracle	North of Tucson				0
Littlefield	NW corner AZ				0
Cristopher Creek	Payson				
Payson	Payson				
Star Valley	Payson				0
Ajo	Ajo/Sells				
Sells - Tohono O'Odham	Ajo/Sells				0
Superior	Copper Corridor				
Globe/Miami	Copper Corridor				
Globe	Copper Corridor				0

# Zerbe, Friesen, Kraver Report

- **Recommendations:**
  - One Comprehensive Pilot As Accessible Exemplar
  - One or More Remote Rural Pilots to Address Unique Challenges
- **Straw Ranking of Potential Pilot Communities by Task Team Leadership**
  - 1. Casa Grande (14)
  - 2. Northern Highway 191 Corridor (5)
  - 3. Colorado River-La Paz County (4)
  - 4. Prescott (7)
  - 5. Wickenburg (2)
  - 6. Nogales (0)
  - 7. Ajo/Sells (0)
  - 8. Holbrook/Seligman – I40 (2)
- **By First of Year: Develop Legislation, Get Inputs of County Superintendents, Use AZ Broadband Map and ADE School Data, Paint Vivid Scenario as Marketing Tool**
- **By Mid Spring: Have Sites Selected and Regional Discussions Underway**
- **By Summer: Have Implementation Underway to Use During 2012-2013 School Year**